

Memorandum

To: Priest Rapids Coordinating Committee Hatchery Subcommittee Document Date: July 30, 2024

From: Tracy Hillman, PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Facilitator

cc: Natasha Winnacott, Anchor QEA

Re: Minutes of the June 20, 2024, PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee Meetings

The Priest Rapids Coordinating Committee's Hatchery Subcommittee (PRCC HSC) meeting focused on the White River (WR) Hatchery Program and was held in person and virtually at the Douglas PUD Auditorium on Thursday, June 20, 2024, from 2:00 p.m. to 3:10 p.m.

Attendees are listed in Attachment A to these meeting minutes.

The following Action Item Summary documents tasks for the PRCC HSC members related to the WR Hatchery Program only. (Action items related to other ongoing business are documented in Action Item Summary and Minutes of the June 20, 2024, Joint HCP-HCs and PRCC HSC meeting.)

Action Item Summary

PRCC Hatchery Subcommittee

Near-Term (to be completed by next meeting)

White River Hatchery Program

Data Sources and Document List for Expert Review Panel (Item I-A)

- Grant PUD staff will assemble existing data sources to answer the questions in Table 1 of the 2018 WR memorandum (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- All committee members will review GPUD's draft WR bibliography for the Expert Panel and identify required materials and supplemental materials for each sub-question 3.1-3.9.
- Katy Shelby will contact Jeff Caisman to determine whether additional otolith samples could be collected from WR juvenile spring Chinook Salmon (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- Mike Tonseth will inquire about data outputs and potential future uses of Mark Sorel's Wenatchee Spring Chinook Salmon life-cycle model (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- Tonseth will inquire about availability of results from the Wenatchee Spring Chinook Salmon Relative Reproductive Success Study, specifically the following (*Note: this item is ongoing*):
 - Results available about the WR spawners
 - Results for both hatchery-origin and natural-origin fish from WR and other tributaries

- Potential development assembly of previously reported results into a single document or an executive summary to support the WR Expert Review Panel
- Rod O'Connor will assemble information about productivity of strays into the WR from the 10-Year comprehensive report (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- O'Connor will assemble information about genetic differentiation of the WR from the 10-Year comprehensive report (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- Tim Taylor will advance the WR spring Chinook Salmon population viability analysis using existing monitoring and evaluation data (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- Mat Maxey will inquire with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) Ecological Services staff about information to support conclusions regarding potential impacts and benefits to Bull Trout (*Note: this item is ongoing*).

Expert Panel Scope, Logistics, Qualifications (Item II-B)

- Tracy Hillman will write a summary on available information on habitat capacity and add it to the summary that Keely Murdoch wrote about available information for limiting life stages and limiting factors.
- Mike Tonseth will write a summary about the sideboards limiting the size of a WR Hatchery Program (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- PRCC HSC members will review the preliminary list of potential expert panel members against the working list of competencies and selection criteria (*Note: this item is ongoing*).
- PRCC HSC members will write a short bibliography for potential expert panel members that they recommended for the expert panel.

Decision Summary

- None.

Agreements

- The PRCC HSC representatives agreed to not include anyone who is currently employed by a signatory agency (e.g., National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration [NOAA] or Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife [WDFW]) as a member on the WR Expert Panel, but they could be included as technical support for panelists.

Review Items

- The PRCC HSC will review the revised WR Broodstock Feasibility Review, distributed on June 14, 2024, for approval during the July 17, 2024, meeting.

- The updated WR Decision Tree, which includes uncertainty regarding whether the WR Hatchery Program could increase probability of meeting Wenatchee Spring Chinook Salmon population recovery plan criteria, was distributed on June 25, 2024.

Finalized Documents

- None.

I. Welcome

A. Agenda, Approval of Past Minutes, Action Item Review

Tracy Hillman welcomed the PRCC HSC and reviewed the agendas. Rod O'Connor asked to add an agenda item that discusses the progress Grant PUD has made on the WR Broodstock Collection Feasibility Review. The PRCC HSC representatives agreed and approved the agenda. The revised meeting minutes from May 15 and May 16, 2024, were reviewed and approved by Parties that attended that meeting.

Action items from the PRCC HSC May 15 and May 16, 2024, meeting were reviewed. (*Note: Italicized text below corresponds to action items from the previous meeting.*)

Near-Term (to be completed by next meeting)

White River Hatchery Program

Data Sources and Document List for Expert Panel (Item II-B)

- *Grant PUD staff will assemble existing data sources to answer the questions in Table 1 of the 2018 WR memorandum (Note: this item is ongoing).*
This item is ongoing.
- *Katy Shelby will contact Jeff Caisman to determine whether additional otolith samples could be collected from WR juvenile spring Chinook Salmon (Note: this item is ongoing).*
This item is ongoing.
- *Mike Tonseth will inquire about data outputs and potential future uses of Mark Sorel's Wenatchee Spring Chinook Salmon life-cycle model (Note: this item is ongoing).*
Tonseth said that Mark Sorel likely will not be able to meet until August or September. This item is ongoing.
- *Tonseth will inquire about availability of results from the Wenatchee Spring Chinook Salmon Relative Reproductive Success Study, specifically the following:*
 - *Results available about the WR spawners*
 - *Results for both hatchery-origin and natural-origin fish from WR and other tributaries*

- *Potential development assembly of previously reported results into a single document or an executive summary to support the WR Expert Review Panel*

Tonseth has not had the opportunity to speak to Mark Sorel yet. This item is ongoing.

- *Grant PUD will inquire about availability of egg-to-fry survival data.*

Grant PUD reached out to Chris Johnson, and he provided his dissertation that should provide information on egg-to-fry survival. Grant PUD will follow up with Johnson to see whether they can share this with PRCC HSC representatives.

- *Rod O'Connor will assemble information about productivity of strays into the WR from the 10-Year comprehensive report.*

This item is ongoing.

- *O'Connor will assemble information about genetic differentiation of the WR from the 10-Year comprehensive report.*

O'Connor has begun gathering the range of significant pages from reports that are specific to the WR. This item is ongoing.

- *Tim Taylor will advance the WR spring Chinook Salmon population viability analysis using existing monitoring and evaluation data. (Note: this item is ongoing).*

This item is ongoing.

- *Taylor will summarize specific requests for habitat and life-cycle model outputs, as needed.*

Taylor said that Mark Sorel's dissertation could be used to help answer question 3.8. This is item ongoing.

- *Mat Maxey will inquire with USFWS Ecological Services staff about information to support conclusions regarding potential impacts and benefits to bull trout.*

Maxey said they are scheduling time to meet in July. This item is ongoing.

Expert Panel Scope, Logistics, Qualifications (Item II-C)

- *Larissa Rohrbach and Tracy Hillman will summarize the key discussion points leading to answers to Steps 1 and 2 in the WR Decision Tree for inclusion in the package of information for the Expert Review Panel.*

Hillman said that he updated the document to include "yes/maybe" between Steps 1 and 2 in the WR Decision Tree and will share it with the PRCC HSC representatives.

- *Keely Murdoch will write a summary about available information for capacity, limiting life stages, and limiting factors.*

Murdoch summarized capacity estimates from a variety of sources. She attempted to add the habitat capacity estimate but was lacking habitat information. She reached out to Hillman, who sent her information, but she was not sure how to use the information. Therefore, she did not add the habitat information in the writeup. She said that she can share what she has with the PRCC HSC representatives, but it is not complete and needs work. Hillman said he will add the

habitat capacity component to the paper but noted that the habitat capacity estimates will only be for the WR basin. Hillman will work on adding the habitat capacity component for Murdoch to review, then they will share it with the PRCC HSC representatives.

- *Tonseth will write a summary about the sideboards limiting the size of a WR Hatchery Program.*
This item is ongoing.
- *PRCC HSC members will review the preliminary list of potential expert panel members against the working list of competencies and selection criteria.*

This item will be discussed during today's meeting. This item is ongoing.

Broodstock Collection Feasibility (Item II-D)

- *Grant PUD will distribute the revised WR Broodstock Collection Feasibility Review for PRCC HSC review.*

This item is ongoing.

II. PRCC HSC

A. Broodstock Collection Feasibility

Grant PUD distributed revisions made to the WR Broodstock Collection Feasibility Review to the PRCC HSC representatives on June 14, 2024. All comments from the April 18, 2024, meeting have been addressed, and PRCC HSC representatives will provide comments for approval during the July 17, 2024, meeting. Tim Taylor noted that they revised the document to include more transparency and to be less overreaching on interpretation of results.

B. Expert Panel Preparations

Representatives from Grant PUD sent out an email on June 14, 2024, stating that they do not support using individuals that are currently employed by a signatory agency (e.g., NOAA and WDFW) as members on the expert panel and would rather include individuals who are independent and free from conflicts of interest. Rod O'Connor reiterated during today's meeting that Grant PUD acknowledges that there is valuable work and publications coming out from these people that will be used by panelists, but Grant PUD does not support them serving as panelists. PRCC HSC representatives agreed, so long as there is still a possibility to include these individuals as technical support to the panelists.

The PRCC HSC representatives worked through the list of potential panelists to distinguish them as meeting the requirement of not being employed by a signatory agency (green highlight), currently employed by a signatory agency and therefore could be a technical advisor only (yellow highlight) or needing more information (blue highlight). Members would like to include Craig Busack as a technical advisor but were unsure whether he is currently working for NOAA as a contractor and

would be willing to participate (highlighted in purple). Brett Farman will check on the availability of Busack. Marc Johnson, Jack Stanford, and Mark Chilcote were removed from the potential panelist list because the PRCC HSC did not think it would be beneficial to include individuals who potentially have strong opinions about hatchery programs (names struck through).

- Mark Sorel (technical advisor)
- Jeff Jorgensen (technical advisor)
- Mike Ford (technical advisor)
- Erik Buhle (technical advisor)
- Dave Fast (retired)
- Rich Carmicheal
- William Smoker
- Craig Busack (technical advisor)
- ~~Marc Johnson~~
- Tom Quinn (currently on ISAB)
- Robin Waples (retired)
- Andy Appleby
- Tom Cooney
- Tim Essington
- Kurt Fausch (retired)
- Peter Moyle (retired)
- Alec Maule
- Stan Gregory
- Steve Schroder
- Laurie Weitkamp (technical advisor)
- ~~Jack Stanford~~
- Jack Williams
- Eric Laudenslager
- Paul Spruel
- Tim Copeland
- Ben Ditty
- ~~Mark Chilcote~~
- Reg Reisenbeckler

WDFW offered the following individuals for consideration:

- Barry Berejikian (NOAA Northwest Fisheries Science Center [NWFSC]—Hatchery supplementation research; technical advisor)
- Chris Tataro (NOAA NWFSC—Hatchery supplementation research; technical advisor)
- Lance Campbell (WDFW—Otolith lab; technical advisor)
- Garrett McKinney (WDFW—Genetics lab, conducts Wenatchee Spring Chinook [SPCH] genetics/baseline data; technical advisor)
- Todd Seamons (WDFW—Genetics lab, conducts Wenatchee SPCH genetics/baseline data; technical advisor)
- Phil Sandstrom (WDFW—Lead for westside monitoring and evaluation programs; technical advisor)
- Devayne Lewis (Columbia River Inter-Tribal Fish Commission [CRITFC]—Conducts and reports parentage-based tagging [PBT] Genetic Stock Identification [GSI] genetic sampling for Upper Columbia River stocks)
- Hayley Nuetzal (CRITFC—Genetics/PBT, lead for American Fisheries Society Hatchery Evaluation Subcommittee)

PRCC HSC representatives will create a short biography for individuals that they added to the list of potential panel members and share with the committee. If PRCC HSC representatives come up with

more names prior to reaching out to potential panelist, they can bring them to the committee for review. Tracy Hillman noted that the PRCC HSC representatives will need to start putting together a writeup including the description of the activity for reaching out to potential panelist.

III. Administration

A. Next Meetings

The next meetings of the HCP-HCs and PRCC HSC will be held on July 17, August 21, and September 18, 2024. Meetings are in person and will be held at Douglas PUD.

IV. Attachments

Attachment A List of Attendees

Attachment A
List of Meeting Attendees

Name	Organization
Natasha Winnacott	Anchor QEA
Tracy Hillman	BioAnalysts, Inc.
Rod O'Connor‡	Grant PUD
Tim Taylor	Grant PUD
Katy Shelby°	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife
Mike Tonseth*‡	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife
Benjamin Goodman°	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife
Megan Finley°	Washington Department of Fish and Wildlife
Matthew Maxey*‡°	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
Brett Farman*‡°	National Marine Fisheries Service
Keely Murdoch*‡	Yakama Nation
Cory Kamphaus*‡°	Yakama Nation
Kirk Truscott*‡	Confederated Tribes of the Colville Reservation

Notes:

* Denotes HCP-HCs member or alternate

‡ Denotes PRCC HSC member or alternate

° Joined remotely